Workplace Violence & Employer Liability

Philip D. Dickinson
Attorney

M. Lee Smith Publishers LLC
Brentwood, Tennessee
This special report provides practical information concerning the subject matters covered. It is sold with the understanding that neither the publisher nor the writer is rendering legal advice or other professional service. Some of the information provided in this special report contains a broad overview of federal law. The law changes regularly, and the law may vary from state to state and from one locality to another. You should consult a competent attorney in your state if you are in need of specific legal advice concerning any of the subjects addressed in this special report.

© 1997 M. Lee Smith Publishers LLC
5201 Virginia Way
P.O. Box 5094
Brentwood, Tennessee 37024-5094

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means without permission in writing from the publisher.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Dickinson, Philip D.
Workplace violence & employer liability / Philip D. Dickinson.
p. cm.
KF1316.D53 1997 97-20822
346.7303'1 — dc21 CIP

Printed in the United States of America
Contents

INTRODUCTION...... 1

1 — THE DUTY TO PROVIDE A SAFE WORKPLACE ...... 5

The Occupational Safety and Health Act...... 5
California Guidelines on Workplace Violence...... 10
Florida, Washington, and Other Initiatives...... 12
The Right to Quit Work...... 13
EEO Laws and Unlawful Harassment...... 14

Policy Pointers...... 15

Remedies for Gender-Motivated Violence...... 16
Workers’ Compensation Laws...... 17
Employer Negligence and Other Torts...... 20

2 — BACKGROUND CHECKS ...... 27

Criminal History Information...... 28
Military Records...... 31
Policy Pointers...... 32

Checks for Substance Abuse...... 33
Policy Pointers...... 36

Honesty and Psychological Profiles...... 36
Policy Pointers...... 38
3 — WORKPLACE SECURITY AND INVESTIGATIONS...... 49

Warning Signals...... 49
Searches and Surveillance...... 49
Policy Pointers...... 51
Monitoring Telephones, Voice Mail, and E-Mail...... 51
Policy Pointers...... 53
Concealed Weapons Laws...... 55
Policy Pointers...... 55
Using the Law and the Courts...... 56
The Rights of the Accused...... 58
Policy Pointers...... 59

4 — CREATE A BATTLE PLAN AGAINST VIOLENCE...... 61

Management Commitment and Employee Involvement...... 61
Worksite Analysis...... 62
Hazard Prevention and Control...... 63
Training and Education...... 64
Post-Incident Response...... 64
Recordkeeping and Evaluation...... 65
OSHA and California DOSH Guidelines...... 66
Homicide is the second leading cause of death to workers in the United States. It accounted for 1,071, or 16 percent, of worker fatalities in 1994. Moreover, in 1993, nearly 21,300 workers were reported injured in nonfatal assaults in the preceding 12 months. These figures were collected by the U.S. Department of Labor’s Bureau of Labor Statistics and represent only the tip of the iceberg.

These statistics do not include threats of physical violence. They do not include fights or assaults that involve no significant injury or which, for one reason or another, go unreported either by a victim or their employer. They also include few, if any, of the thousands of claims filed each year for sexual or other discriminatory harassment. Those claims can include allegations of rape, physical assault, and a wide range of threatening or aggressive behavior. Finally, customers, clients, and other outsiders also are victims of workplace violence.

Let’s clarify our terms. The National Institute for Occupational Safety and Health (NIOSH) offers these definitions of “workplace” and “workplace violence”—

**Workplace** — Any location, either permanent or temporary, where an employee performs any work-related duty. This includes, but is not limited to, the buildings and the surrounding perimeters, including the parking lots, field locations, clients’ homes, and traveling to and from work assignments.

**Workplace Violence** — Any physical assault, threatening behavior or verbal abuse occurring in the work setting. It includes, but is not limited to, beatings, stabings, suicides, shootings, rapes, near suicides, psychological traumas such as threats, obscene phone calls, an intimidating presence, and harassment of any nature such as being followed, sworn at or shouted at.

News headlines focus on sensational acts by “disgruntled” workers and terrorists. These possibilities must be considered by today’s employer. However, there are other causes of workplace violence. About half of the fatalities occur at convenience stores, groceries, and other small retail establishments, with robbery being the usual motive. Nearly two-thirds of nonfatal assaults take place at nursing homes, hospitals, or residential care facilities or involve other social services. Although men account for 82 percent of the fatalities, women comprise 56 percent of the victims of nonfatal assaults. Here are typical causes —
By Employees

- Adverse employment decisions
- Job stress
- Job disputes with co-workers
- Personality conflicts with co-workers
- Problems in family or personal relationships
- Financial stress
- Influence of drugs or alcohol
- Other emotional or mental problems

By Outsiders

- Larceny and sexual assault crimes
- Domestic violence and jealousy
- Stalking and other obsessive behavior
- Moral or political protests
- Customer or client frustration
- Patient behavior
- Influence of drugs or alcohol
- Other emotional or mental problems

Besides the personal suffering, assaults at work cost an estimated 1,750,000 lost work days and $55 million in lost wages annually. The mental anguish and emotional distress stemming from incidents of harassment and threats no doubt add substantially to those dollars. Factoring in the cost of lost productivity, legal expenses, increased security costs, and other items, a U.S. Department of Justice survey speculated that the annual economic cost of workplace violence for employee and employer runs into the billions of dollars.

Duty to Provide a Safe Workplace. Federal and state job safety laws require employers to make reasonable efforts to provide a safe workplace. This duty may include steps to reduce the risk of violence. The federal Occupational Safety and Health Administration, California’s Division of Occupational Safety and Health (DOSH), and other state agencies are beginning to issue guidelines for health care operations, night retail establishments, and employers in general. These guidelines are designed to help employers fight violence, but they also raise the prospect of OSHA citations if the problem is ignored.

Employers also may be liable for negligence if they fail to exercise ordinary care to avoid potential violence. Violence by employees can create liability for negligent hiring, retention, supervision, or training if their conduct was reasonably foreseeable. Employers and business property owners also face potential liability for failing to address an increased risk of violence from the outside, such as a threat of night-time assaults or robberies in a high-crime area. Workers’ compensation laws cover some workplace injuries due to violence, but not all. The rules vary from state to state.

Federal and state job discrimination laws compel employers to implement anti-harassment policies and to take prompt action when harassment occurs. Sexual, racial, and other forms of harassment can lead to liability for compensatory and punitive damages. In addition, a new federal law may expose employers to liability for gender-motivated violence.

Background Checks Help, but Restrictions Apply. Conducting background checks on job applicants is one weapon in the employer’s anti-violence arsenal. A thorough check may weed out someone with a history of violence or behaviors often associated with a heightened potential for violence. Criminal history information, credit reports, and job references can provide important information. Substance abuse testing, psychological tests, and sharp interviewing also can be useful tools, not merely to avoid workplace violence, but to hire effective, productive employees.
Negligent hiring cases suggest that a failure to conduct an adequate background check may provide a basis for liability if something does happen. Criminal background checks often are required for specific jobs that involve working with children or caring for others. On the other hand, there can be legal roadblocks. Title VII and state EEO laws limit an employer’s legal right not only to ask about arrests without convictions, but also to make decisions based on criminal records that are not job-related. The Americans with Disabilities Act limits the ability to make pre-employment inquiries relating to a person’s mental health. And, private sector employers are not allowed to submit job applicants to polygraph tests.

Background checks and preemployment tests also involve balancing an employer’s need to know with individuals’ protection from defamation or intrusions into their privacy. Many states recently have enacted “job reference immunity” laws designed to encourage companies to provide good-faith references to prospective employers without fear of libel suits. However, whether these statutes really change the rules is debatable.

Employers Can Monitor Conduct at Work. Employers have a right to control the workplace. They can regulate access to the jobsite with security guards, physical barriers, identification requirements, and high-tech surveillance techniques. They also have broad discretion to search work areas in response to suspected employee misconduct and to monitor workers’ telephone and E-mail communications. Employers also can be ready to enforce criminal laws against threats and violence, and to assist threatened employees in getting protective orders. California now allows employers to petition for civil orders to enjoin workplace stalking.

Suspects also have rights, however. Policies on searches and monitoring should be clearly communicated to avoid liability for privacy or wiretap violations. Work rules prohibiting violence, harassment, fighting, and weapons also should be clearly stated and enforced evenly. In many states, employees have a legal right to carry concealed weapons at work unless a no-weapons policy exists. If management “shoots from the hip” without investigating or investigates unwisely, the accused could sue the employer for invasion of privacy, defamation, false imprisonment, wrongful discharge, breach of contract, or job discrimination.

Create a Battle Plan. Employers should have a comprehensive plan to reduce the potential for violence. Create a threat assessment team to analyze the risks present at the work site and then to develop and implement a program to respond to those risks. In addition to physical modifications to facilities and administrative controls, training of supervisors and employees on violence-related issues is essential. A crisis management team also should be in place to respond effectively when an incident does occur. OSHA and California’s DOSH have issued recommendations on what should be in a plan.
Philip D. Dickinson is an attorney and legal writer residing in Libertyville, Illinois. His professional background includes 25 years with CCH INCORPORATED as a law editor and Group Managing Editor for information services on labor and employment law, and human resources management. In these roles, he provided content and editorial supervision for the CCH Labor Law Reports, Employment Practice Guide, and Labor Arbitration Awards series, as well as various publications on the Fair Labor Standards Act. He also guided the design, creation, and editing of CCH Human Resources Management, Human Resources Management on CD-ROM, and Accommodating Disabilities: A Business Management Guide.

Mr. Dickinson also is the author of “Employee Privacy Rights & Wrongs” and “Hiring Smart: How to Conduct Background Checks” in M. Lee Smith’s series of HR Executive Special Reports. His other published works include, “Florida Employment Series: Age Discrimination, Disability Discrimination and Sexual Harassment” for Miranda Press, and “Employment Discrimination: Quick Answers to Everyday Questions” for CCH.

Admitted to practice in Maryland, Mr. Dickinson holds a J.D. from The George Washington University National Law Center in Washington, D.C., and an A.B. in History from Franklin & Marshall College in Lancaster, PA. Mr. Dickinson and his wife, Mary, are proud parents of two wonderful and talented children.
About the Publisher

Attorney M. Lee Smith publishes HR Executive Special Reports. Now in its 22nd year, M. Lee Smith Publishers LLC is committed to provide you with solutions to your employment law questions.

In addition to the HR Executive Special Reports, we publish your state’s Employment Law Letter, environmental compliance and health law newsletters, state-specific employment law desk manuals, and much more. If you would like more information regarding our other publications, please call our toll-free customer service hotline. Or, visit our World Wide Web home page that showcases all the products we offer.

Our 100-plus newsletters, books, and directories alert readers to new laws, regulations, and court cases on the state level, including easy-to-understand information on federal laws all reported with your state’s local laws and regulations in mind. That’s unlike most other newsletters that only report on federal developments. And because each of our publications is written by a talented team of in-state attorneys, you learn quickly of changes taking place affecting your operation.

Like the HR Executive Special Reports, all of our newsletters feature our no-risk guarantee. If you’re dissatisfied, for any reason, you are entitled to a complete refund. You have no risk.

Customer Service: (800) 274-6774
E-mail: custserv@mleesmith.com
Home page: http://www.mleesmith.com
ORDER FORM

If you would like additional copies of this special report or any other of our HR Executive Special Reports for your supervisory or managerial staff, please use the convenient order form below. Discounts available on multiple copies of individual titles. Please call 800-274-6774 for more information. Please add $6 to your total order for shipping and handling.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Quantity</th>
<th>Unit Cost</th>
<th>Price</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Employee Privacy Rights &amp; Wrongs</td>
<td></td>
<td>$97</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Workplace Violence &amp; Employer Liability</td>
<td></td>
<td>$97</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How to Conduct Internal Investigations</td>
<td></td>
<td>$97</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How to Manage Problem Employees</td>
<td></td>
<td>$97</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FMLA, ADA &amp; Workers’ Comp: Navigating the Treacherous Triangle</td>
<td></td>
<td>$97</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How to Fire Employees Without Getting Burned</td>
<td></td>
<td>$97</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Company You Keep: Four Key Tools for Employee Retention</td>
<td></td>
<td>$97</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Legal Guide to Successful Hiring</td>
<td></td>
<td>$97</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The H in OSHA Stands for Health</td>
<td></td>
<td>$97</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Workplace Harassment Trail Guide: Avoiding the Avalanche Zone</td>
<td></td>
<td>$97</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FMLA Leave: A Walk Through the Legal Labyrinth</td>
<td></td>
<td>$97</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ten Commandments for Avoiding Religious Harassment and Discrimination Claims</td>
<td></td>
<td>$97</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How to Avoid the HR Hazards of Your Electronic Workplace</td>
<td></td>
<td>$97</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ADA from A to Z</td>
<td></td>
<td>$97</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How to Manage Your Aging Workforce</td>
<td></td>
<td>$97</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How to Discipline &amp; Document Employee Behavior</td>
<td></td>
<td>$97</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How to Make Background Checks Part of Your Hiring Process</td>
<td></td>
<td>$97</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Know Your Responsibilities: Ethics &amp; Fiduciary Duties for HR</td>
<td></td>
<td>$97</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How to Manage &amp; Minimize Absenteeism</td>
<td></td>
<td>$97</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overtime Ins and Outs: How to Comply with the FLSA</td>
<td></td>
<td>$97</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How to Comply with COBRA Without Getting Bit</td>
<td></td>
<td>$97</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How to Evaluate &amp; Manage Employee Health Plans</td>
<td></td>
<td>$97</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How to Make Telecommuting Work for Your Company</td>
<td></td>
<td>$97</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Defamation in the Workplace</td>
<td></td>
<td>$97</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stop It Before It Starts: The HR Manager’s Guide to Preventing Sexual Harassment</td>
<td></td>
<td>$97</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reducing Risk for Reductions in Force</td>
<td></td>
<td>$97</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Subtotal $________ plus shipping and handling $6.00
Grand Total $________

Bill me
My check is enclosed
VISA
MasterCard
American Express

Card #______________________________________________________ exp._____________

Signature _______________________________________________________________________

Name _______________________________________________________________________

Company/Title _______________________________________________________________

Address _______________________________________________________________________

City/State/Zip _________________________________________________________________

Phone __________________ Fax __________________ E-mail _________________________

For faster service call toll-free 800-274-6774 or fax this form to 800-785-9212
Mail this form to: M. Lee Smith Publishers LLC • 5201 Virginia Way • P.O. Box 5094 • Brentwood, TN 37024-5094 • http://www.mleesmith.com • E-mail: custserv@mleesmith.com
If you would like more information on our many products and services for human resource professionals, please call our customer service department at 800-274-6774 and request a copy of our Product Guide. You may also E-mail us — custserv@mleesmith.com.
Workplace violence is a growing social problem. Some of this growth may be perceptual, reflecting our new awareness of what constitutes violence in the workplace. Furthermore, much of what falls under its current rubric does not correspond to the classic image of worker-on-worker or worker-on-employer mayhem. Aiming the liability threat at the employer may be the most effective and efficient strategy. There are ample theories to choose from: negligence (tort) law, agency law, contract, civil rights, and regulatory law. Judges and juries appear eager to hold employers accountable for violent incidents in the workplace, sometimes in the face of other, more logical constructions of the facts or theory. Workplace violence is generally categorized into five types. Type I Criminal Intent. The perpetrator has no legitimate relationship with the targeted establishment and the primary motive is generally theft. Type II Customer / Client. The perpetrator is a customer or client of worker or employer and the violence occurs in conjunction with worker’s normal duties. Type III Worker-to-Worker. The perpetrator is a current or former employee and the motivating factor is often interpersonal or work-related conflicts, losses or traumas and may involve a sense of injustice or unfairness. Workplace Violence costs American employers not only in dollars and cents, but also in a significant loss in productivity. It is estimated that American businesses lose approximately 36 billion dollars per year as a result of workplace violence. This figure includes monetary costs from lost productivity, legal fees, settlement costs and jury verdicts. Out-of-court settlements for lawsuits arising out of workplace violence average $500,000, with jury verdicts averaging about $3 million. The two main theories of liability are negligent hiring and supervision. The legal premise is that no one would have been hurt if the employer had checked into the employee’s background or paid closer attention to the warning signs from the employee’s behavior. Employer Responsibilities.