This book is the product of extended research by five scholars working in the area of private international law. It provides a comprehensive review and analysis of the jurisprudence surrounding the United Nations Convention on Contracts for the International Sale of Goods (CISG). As of February 15, 2005, sixty-four countries have adopted the CISG as their international sales law. Given its importance as the world’s preeminent sales law, the authors believe that a fresh analysis of the evolving case and arbitral law is needed at this time. It has been fifteen years since the adoption of the CISG, and in those years a critical mass of interpretive jurisprudence has developed. The analysis in the book is undertaken at two levels—the practical interpretation of the CISG and the theoretical limits of interpreting supranational conventions.

Larry A. DiMatteo is a Professor of Legal Studies at the University of Florida. He is a graduate of the Cornell and Harvard Law Schools. He is the author of many law review articles and four books, mostly in the area of contract law and theory. His books include *Contract Theory: The Evolution of Contractual Intent* (1998) and *The Law of International Contracting* (2000).

Lucien J. Dhooge is an Associate Professor of Business Law at the University of the Pacific. He received his Juris Doctor from the University of Denver College of Law and his LL.M. from the Georgetown University Law Center. Before coming to the University of the Pacific, he spent eleven years in practice with the Federal Trade Commission in Washington, D.C., and with private firms in Denver.

Stephanie Greene is an Assistant Professor of Business Law at Boston College. She is a graduate of Boston College Law School, where she served as Executive Editor of the *Boston College Law Review*. She has practiced law in the Real Estate Department at Hale & Dorr in Boston and continues to serve as counsel to the firm of Green & Hoffman, where she specializes in civil litigation.

Virginia G. Maurer is the Hubert Hurst Professor of Business Law and Legal Studies at the University of Florida. She is a graduate of Stanford Law School. She is the Director of The Poe Center for Business Ethics at the Warrington College of Business at the University of Florida. She also was the Editor-in-Chief of the *American Business Law Journal*.

Marisa Anne Pagnattaro is an Assistant Professor of Legal Studies at the Terry College of Business at the University of Georgia. She earned her J.D. from New York Law School and Ph.D. from the University of Georgia. She was a litigation attorney with Kilpatrick and Cody (now known as Kilpatrick Stockton LLP), where her practice was devoted to corporate and securities litigation. Dr. Pagnattaro is the former Editor-in-Chief of the *Georgia Bar Journal*.
INTERNATIONAL SALES LAW

A CRITICAL ANALYSIS OF CISG JURISPRUDENCE

Larry A. DiMatteo
University of Florida

Lucien J. Dhooge
University of the Pacific

Stephanie Greene
Boston College

Virginia G. Maurer
University of Florida

Marisa Anne Pagnattaro
University of Georgia
To Colleen and Ian Griffith DiMatteo,
and to friends old and wise: Jeffery and Janet Barat, Lucy DiVirgilio,
Pat and Anne Dooley, Nadim and Christine Habib, Jeffrey and Marcie LePine,
Michael Meagher, Robert and Ann Marie Morrow, Joseph and Rita Zinni
LAD

To Julia
LJD

To Tom, Tucker, Natasha, and Melissa Greene
SG

To the guys – Ralph Gerald, Ralph Emmett, and William Edward Maurer
VGM

To Marian and Peter Pagnattaro
MAP
## CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Preface</th>
<th>page xi</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgments</td>
<td>xiii</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 1 INTRODUCTION

- CISG as International Convention  
- Principle of Uniformity  
  - Strict or Absolute Uniformity versus Relative Uniformity  
  - Uniformity through Original or Autonomous Interpretation  
- CISG as Soft Law: Uniformity through the Prism of Customary International Law  
  
### 2 CISG METHODOLOGY AND JURISPRUDENCE

- Interpretive Methodology  
- General Principles  
  - Principle of Good Faith  
- General Default Rules and Specific Default Rule Creation  
  
### 3 FORMATION: WRITING REQUIREMENTS

- Precontractual Liability  
- Writing Requirements and the Parol Evidence Rule  
  - The Writing Requirements of Articles 11, 12, and 13  
  - Parol Evidence: National Courts and Articles 11 and 29  
- Admissibility of Parol Evidence  
- Types of Extrinsic Evidence  
- Contract Modification  
  
### 4 FORMATION: OFFER AND ACCEPTANCE RULES

- Offer Rules and Open Price Term: Articles 14 and 55  
- Firm Offers: Articles 15–17 and 20–24  
- Rules of Acceptance: Article 18  

© Cambridge University Press  
www.cambridge.org
# Contents

Battle of the Forms 66

National Courts and Article 19 67

## 5 Obligations of Buyers

- The Duty to Inspect, Give Notice, and Preserve Goods 76
  - Inspection Duties and Rights: Article 38 78
  - Notice of Nonconformity: Article 39 84
  - Reasonable Excuse: Article 44 91
- Payment of Price and the Taking of Delivery 93
  - Formalities of Payment: Article 54 94
  - Price: Article 55 95
  - Place of Payment: Article 57 97
  - Time of Payment: Article 58 99

## 6 Obligations of Sellers

- The Duty of Delivery 101
  - Place of Delivery: Article 31 104
  - Time of Delivery: Article 33 107
- Express and Implied Warranties 107
  - Warranties: Article 35 110
  - Risk of Loss and Warranties: Article 36 118
  - Effect of Seller’s Knowledge: Article 40 119

## 7 Common Obligations of Buyers and Sellers

- Passing of Risk 121
- Fundamental and Anticipatory Breach 123
  - Fundamental Breach: Article 25 125
  - Anticipatory Breach, Adequate Assurance, and Installment Contracts: Articles 71–73 128

## 8 Breach of Contract by Seller

- Right to Substituted or Repaired Goods 132
- Right to Affix Additional Time 134
- Right to Avoid Contract 135
- Right to a Price Reduction 138

## 9 Breach of Contract by Buyer

- Nachfrist Notice: Article 47 140
- Late Performance: Article 48 145
- Avoidance of Contract: Article 64 146
- Effects of Avoidance: Articles 81–84 149
# Contents

## 10 DAMAGES, EXCUSE, AND PRESERVATION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Calculation of Damages: Articles 75 and 76</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Limiting Doctrines: Articles 74 and 77</td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doctrine of Foreseeability</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attorney Fees and Debt Collection</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doctrine of Mitigation</td>
<td>157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Impediment (Excuse) to Performance: Article 79</td>
<td>158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preservation of Goods: Articles 87 and 88</td>
<td>160</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## 11 SUMMARY AND OBSERVATIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Developing an International Jurisprudence</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Filling in the Gaps and the Fabrication of Specific Default Rules</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Particularized Express Consent</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Importance of Trade Usage in CISG Rule Application</td>
<td>168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Importance of Notice</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Burden of Proof</td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Persistence of <em>Homeward Trend</em></td>
<td>174</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## TABLE OF AUTHORITIES AND CASES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>APPENDIX A: UNITED NATIONS CONVENTION ON CONTRACTS FOR THE INTERNATIONAL SALE OF GOODS (CISG) (APRIL 11, 1980)</td>
<td>209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPENDIX B: CISG: TABLE OF CONTRACTING STATES (AS OF FEBRUARY 8, 2005)</td>
<td>231</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Index</td>
<td>233</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
This book is the product of extended research by five scholars working in the area of private international law. It provides a comprehensive review and analysis of the jurisprudence surrounding the United Nations Convention on Contracts for the International Sale of Goods (CISG). As of February 8, 2005, sixty-four countries have adopted the CISG as their international sales law. Given its importance as the world’s preeminent sales law, the authors believe that a fresh analysis of the evolving case and arbitral law is needed. It has been fifteen years since the CISG, went into effect on January 1, 1988, and in those years a critical mass of interpretive jurisprudence has developed. The analysis in the book is undertaken at two levels – the practical interpretation of the CISG and the theoretical limits of interpretation of supranational conventions.

Critics have argued that the benefits of uniform international business law are minimal and that national courts will inevitably be the conscious or subconscious victims of homeward trend or domestic gloss analysis. In responding to this criticism, the authors address the following four questions:

- How has the CISG in fact been interpreted and applied by the various national courts?
- Is there evidence of convergence or divergence among the national courts in interpreting the CISG?
- Is the current level of disharmony associated with divergent national interpretations acceptable from the perspective of the CISG’s mandate of uniformity?
- How does divergence in national interpretations impact the effectiveness or functionality of the CISG?

The book concludes that despite the problem of diverging interpretations, there are signs that courts are taking more seriously their role in applying CISG
interpretive methodology. There is evidence of a coalescing of the different interpretations through the formulation of more specific default rules and the recognition of factors to be used in applying CISG articles. This book provides an analysis of those provisions of the CISG that have been applied in a “critical mass” of court and arbitral decisions. In doing so, the book assesses the state of international sales law. The book is timely given the maturing state of CISG jurisprudence.

INTENDED AUDIENCE

The book presents some theoretical themes but is mostly a descriptive work. It reviews case law and arbitral decisions in order to gain insight into the various interpretations rendered on the general and often ambiguous provisions of the CISG. Cases are described and analyzed to determine interpretive trends such as evolving default rules and factors analyses. The authors believe that the book’s ultimate character is as a general reference work aimed at practitioner and scholarly researchers. It is not meant to compete with the more comprehensive volumes currently in existence. It is meant to add to that literature by providing a fresh analysis of CISG jurisprudence. Legal cases, arbitral decisions, and the secondary literature are listed in the Table of Authorities and Cases, which is segmented by areas and CISG articles. Finally, the text of the CISG and a list of signatory countries are provided in the Appendices.
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

We would first like to thank the Academy of Legal Studies in Business, which has provided us the professional venue to meet and discuss such topics as private international law. This book began as a panel discussion at the Academy’s 2003 annual meeting in Nashville, Tennessee. We are grateful to the International Law Section of the Academy for bestowing the Ralph J. Bunche Award for Best International Paper to a paper that became the basis for this book. We would like to thank the Editorial Board of the *Northwestern Journal of International Law & Business* for providing excellent editorial assistance in transforming the manuscript into a polished work. We acknowledge the Journal’s copyright of the materials appearing in Volume 24 and thank the Journal for granting a copyright release of that article for use in this book. We also acknowledge and thank the *Yale Journal of International Law* and the American Arbitration Association’s *Dispute Resolution Journal* for granting us permission to publish excerpts from previous published works. We would like to especially thank John Berger, our editor at Cambridge University Press, for his faith in this effort. Finally, we would like to thank our deans and colleagues at our respective schools for providing the support and intellectual environments vital to such undertakings.

Gainesville, Florida
October 1, 2004